

¹Brain Disease Research Centre, Korea Institute of Oriental Medicine, Daejeon, South Korea ²Complementary Medicine, Peninsula Medical School, University of Exeter, Exeter, UK

Correspondence to

Myeong Soo Lee, Brain Disease Research Centre, Korea Institute of Oriental Medicine, 461-24, Jeonmindong, Yuseong-gu, Daejeon 305-811, South Korea; drmslee@gmail.com

Accepted 8 February 2011 Published Online First 16 May 2011

Systematic reviews of t'ai chi: an overview

Myeong Soo Lee,^{1,2} Edzard Ernst²

ABSTRACT

Several systematic reviews (SRs) have assessed the effectiveness of t'ai chi for many conditions including hypertension, osteoarthritis and fall prevention; however, their conclusions have been contradictory. The aim of this overview was to critically evaluate the SRs of t'ai chi for any improvement of medical conditions or clinical symptoms. English, Chinese and Korean electronic databases were searched for relevant articles, and data were extracted according to predefined criteria; 35 SRs met our inclusion criteria. They were related to the following conditions: cancer, older people, Parkinson's disease, musculoskeletal pain, osteoarthritis, rheumatoid arthritis (RA), muscle strength and flexibility, improving aerobic capacity, cardiovascular disease and risk factors, lowering resting blood pressure, osteoporosis or bone mineral density, type 2 diabetes, psychological health, fall prevention and improving balance, and any chronic conditions. In several instances, the conclusions of these articles were contradictory. Relatively clear evidence emerged to suggest that t'ai chi is effective for fall prevention and improving psychological health and was associated with general health benefits for older people. However, t'ai chi seems to be ineffective for the symptomatic treatment of cancer and RA. In conclusion, many SRs of t'ai chi have recently been published; however, the evidence is convincingly positive only for fall prevention and for improvement of psychological health.

INTRODUCTION

T'ai chi combines deep breathing and relaxation with slow and gentle movements.¹ It is based on an assumption from Confucian and Buddhist philosophy that states that two opposing life forces, yin and yang, govern our health.¹ Ill health is viewed as an imbalance between yin and yang, and t'ai chi can reportedly rebalance such energy disturbances. Regardless of these assumptions, the slow movements between different postures that are normally held for short periods of time represent physical stimuli, which affect the cardiovascular and muscular systems.¹

It has been reported that t'ai chi has beneficial effects in reducing high blood pressure, improving balance and muscle strength, and preventing falls.² T'ai chi is supported by several associations, including the Arthritis Foundation of Australia, Diabetes Australia, and the National Parkinson Foundation in the USA, and 2 500 000 individuals reportedly use it regularly for health reasons.³ However, the clinical effectiveness of t'ai chi remains uncertain.¹ Many clinical trials have emerged, but their results are contradictory. Systematic reviews that assess all of this evidence arrive at similarly contradictory conclusions. This overview is aimed at summarising and critically evaluating all SRs that involve t'ai chi as a treatment for any health condition. Our ultimate goal is to provide clinicians with clearer guidance on the value of this approach.

METHODS

Electronic literature searches were carried out in July 2010 using Medline, Embase, Amed, CINHAL, the Cochrane Library, six Korean Medical Databases (Korean Studies Information, DBPIA, Korea Institute of Science and Technology Information, KERIS, KoreaMed, and Korean National Assembly Library) and Chinese Database (CNKI) without restrictions on the study date or language. The search terms were the MESH terms of 't'ai chi' AND 'systematic review' OR 'metaanalysis.' In addition, our departmental files were hand-searched. Abstracts of reviews located using this search were inspected by two authors, and those appearing to meet the inclusion criteria were retrieved and read in full by all of the authors of the current review. The reviews were defined as systematic if they included explicit inclusion/ exclusion criteria as well as an explicit and repeatable methods section that described the search strategy.

To be included, a systematic review had to specifically address the effectiveness of t'ai chi and include evidence from at least two controlled clinical trials. Systematic reviews that evaluated t'ai chi in combination with other types of treatment without separately evaluating the individual approaches were excluded.

The assessments of the quality of the primary studies were adopted from the respective SRs. The Overview Quality Assessment Questionnaire (OQAQ) was used to evaluate the methodological quality of all of the included SRs.⁴ The OQAQ score ranges from 1 to 7; a score of 3 or less indicated extensive or major flaws, and a score of 5 or more suggested minor or minimal flaws. The two authors independently assessed the OQAQ and extracted the data using predefined criteria (table 1), and discrepancies were settled by discussion.

RESULTS

Our searches generated 55 hits, and 35 SRs met our inclusion criteria (figure 1, table 1),⁵⁻³⁹ which had been published between 2002 and 2010. The first authors originated from the USA (n=10), the UK (n=9), Korea (n=6), France (n=2), Australia (n=2), Netherlands (n=2), Canada (n=1), New Zealand (n=1), Singapore (n=1) and Sweden (n=1). Ten reviews incorporated a meta-analytic approach.^{5 11 14 17 18 20 21 24 27 32} The reviews were based on two to 47 primary studies.

Author (year)(reference)Condition/populationciLee et al (2010) ⁵ Breast cancerLee et al (2007) ⁶ Cancer3)Lee et al (2003) ⁹ Older adults2Lee et al (2008) ¹⁰ Older adults2Aerhagen et al (2008) ¹⁰ Older adults2Lee et al (2008) ¹⁰ Older adults2Lee et al (2008) ¹⁰ Older adults2Lee et al (2008) ¹⁰ Musculoskeletal pain2Hal et al (2009) ¹¹ Musculoskeletal pain2Lee et al (2009) ¹³ Rheumatoid arthritisHan et al (2009) ¹³ Multiple sclerosisChoi et al (2009) ¹³ Muscle strength and flexibilityLee et al (2009) ¹³ Muscle strength and flexibilityLee et al (2009) ¹³ Cardiovascular disease and risk factorsLee et al (2009) ¹³ Lewering aerobic capacity feh et al (2009) ¹³ Lee et al (2003) ¹³ Lowering aerobic capacity feh et al (2003) ²⁴ Lee et al (2003) ²⁶ Lowering aerobic capacity risk factorsLee et al (2008) ²⁴ Lowering of blood pressure in older peopleLee et al (2008) ²⁴ Reducing of blood pressure and insk factorsLee et al (2008) ²⁴ Reducing of blood pressure and insk factorsLee et al (2008) ²⁴ SteoporosisMayne et al (2008) ²⁵ Bone-mineral density function	controlled trials				svstematic		
.ee et al (2010) ⁵ Breast cancer .ee et al (2007) ⁶ Cancer 3 .ee et al (2008) ⁸ Older adults 2 .ee et al (2008) ¹⁰ Musculoskeletal pain 2 .ee et al (2009) ¹¹ Musculoskeletal pain 2 .ee et al (2009) ¹³ Multiple sclerosis 2 Alm et al (2009) ¹³ Multiple sclerosis 2 Alm et al (2009) ¹³ Muscle strength and flexibility 1 Choi et al (2009) ¹³ Muscle strength and flexibility 2 Cardiovascular disease and risk factors 2 2 Cardiovascular disease and risk fac	S	controlled trials	Meta-analysis†	Conclusion (quote)	review 00A0*	Result	Country
cee et al (2007) ⁶ Cancer 3 Rogers et al (2008) ⁸ Older adults 3 cee et al (2008) ¹⁰ Older adults 3 cee et al (2008) ¹⁰ Older adults 2 ferhagen et al (2009) ¹¹ Parkinson's disease 3 ce et al (2009) ¹¹ Musculoskeletal pain 2 ce et al (2009) ¹¹ Rheumatoid arthritis 3 lan et al (2007) ¹³ Rheumatoid arthritis 3 dain et al (2009) ¹¹ Osteoarthritis 3 lan et al (2009) ¹³ Multiple sclerosis 3 lan et al (2009) ¹³ Musculos etropid arthritis 3 lan et al (2009) ¹³ Rheumatoid arthritis 3 laylor-Piliae (2008) ¹⁸ Musculos etropid arthritis 3 laylor-Piliae (2009) ¹⁹ Improving aerobic capacity 3 ce et al (2009) ¹⁹ Improving aerobic capacity 3 leh et al (2009) ¹⁹ Cardiovascular disease and risk factors 3 cee et al (2008) ²¹ Improving aerobic capacity 3 ce et al (2008) ²² Cardiovascular disease and risk factors 3 ce et al (2008) ²² Low		Poor	Quality of life: SMD, 0.45 (0.25, 1.14)	the existing trial evidence does not show convincingly	7	I	Korea
Rogers et al (2008) ⁷ Older adults 3 .ee et al (2008) ⁸ Older adults 2 .ee et al (2008) ¹⁰ Older adults 2 .ee et al (2008) ¹⁰ Parkinson's disease 2 all et al (2008) ¹¹ Parkinson's disease 2 .ee et al (2009) ¹¹ Musculoskeletal pain 2 .ee et al (2007) ¹³ Rheumatoid arthritis 2 Binns and Taylor (2008) ¹⁵ Multiple sclerosis 2 Sinns and Taylor (2008) ¹⁶ Multiple sclerosis 2 Sinns and Taylor (2009) ¹⁹ Multiple sclerosis 2 Choi et al (2009) ¹⁹ Multiple sclerosis 2 Choi et al (2009) ¹⁹ Improving aerobic capacity 2 Cee et al (2009) ¹⁹ Improving aerobic capacity 2 Centiovascular disease and risk factors 2 2 Lewering resting blood 2 2 2 ee et al (2009) ¹⁹ Cardiovascular disease and risk factors 2 2 ee et al (2009) ²⁰ Cardiovascular disease and risk factors 2 2 ee et al (2008) ²¹ Lowering resting blood pressure and risk factors 2	с	Poor	No	The evidence is not convincing.	5	I	UK
cee et al (2008) ⁸ Older adults 2 lerhagen et al (2004) ⁹ Older adults Parkinson's disease iall et al (2008) ¹⁰ Musculoskeletal pain iall et al (2009) ¹¹ Musculoskeletal pain ee et al (2008) ¹² Rheumatoid arthritis fan et al (2009) ¹³ Bheumatoid arthritis fan et al (2009) ¹³ Osteoarthritis fan et al (2009) ¹³ Multiple sclerosis Shoi et al (2009) ¹³ Muscle strength and Choi et al (2009) ¹³ Muscle strength and Choi et al (2009) ¹³ Improving aerobic capacity Improving aerobic cardiovascular disease and risk factors cardiovascular disease and risk factors ee et al (2009) ¹³ Cardiovascular disease and cardiovascular disease and risk factors cardiovascular disease and risk factors ee et al (2009) ¹³ Cardiovascular disease and cin et al (2008) ²² Reducing of blood pressure ee et al (2008) ²² Reducing of blood pressure and cin et al (2008) ²² Reducing of blood pressure and cin et al (2008) ²⁴ Osteoprosis <td>36</td> <td>Variable</td> <td>No</td> <td> T'ai chi may help older adults</td> <td>1</td> <td>+</td> <td>USA</td>	36	Variable	No	T'ai chi may help older adults	1	+	USA
<i>(erhagen et al.</i> (2004) ⁹ Older adults <i>ee et al.</i> (2008) ¹⁰ Parkinson's disease <i>ial et al.</i> (2009) ¹¹ Musculoskeletal pain <i>ee et al.</i> (2007) ¹³ Rheumatoid arthritis <i>ian et al.</i> (2007) ¹³ Rheumatoid arthritis <i>ian et al.</i> (2007) ¹³ Rheumatoid arthritis <i>ian et al.</i> (2007) ¹³ Multiple sclerosis <i>inns and Taylor</i> (2008) ¹⁵ Multiple sclerosis <i>inns and Taylor</i> (2008) ¹⁹ Musculoskeletal and flexibility <i>inprovement of aerobic capacity</i> Improving aerobic capacity <i>(eh et al.</i> (2009) ¹⁹ Cardiovascular disease and risk factors <i>iew et al.</i> (2009) ¹⁹ Lowering resting blood <i>ee et al.</i> (2008) ²² Reducing of blood pressure <i>isk factors</i> Cardiovascular disease and risk factors <i>iew et al.</i> (2008) ²² Reducing of blood pressure and risk factors <i>isk factors</i> Cardiovascular disease and risk factors <tr< td=""><td>29</td><td>Variable</td><td>No</td><td>T'ai chi exercise appears to have physical and psychosocial benefits</td><td>-</td><td>+</td><td>Korea</td></tr<>	29	Variable	No	T'ai chi exercise appears to have physical and psychosocial benefits	-	+	Korea
Lee et al (2008) ¹⁰ Parkinson's disease Iall et al (2009) ¹¹ Musculoskeletal pain Lee et al (2007) ¹³ Rheumatoid arthritis All an et al (2004) ¹⁴ Osteoarthritis Rheumatoid arthritis Rheumatoid arthritis All at al (2005) ¹⁶ Multiple sclerosis Sinns and Taylor (2008) ¹⁵ Multiple sclerosis Sinns and Taylor (2008) ¹⁶ Multiple sclerosis Choi et al (2009) ¹⁹ Muscle strength and Choi et al (2009) ¹⁹ Muscle strength and Taylor-Piliae (2008) ¹⁸ Muscle strength and Allor and Taylor (2008) ¹⁹ Cardiovascular disease and Lee et al (2009) ¹⁹ Cardiovascular disease and Lee et al (2003) ¹³ Cardiovascular disease and Lee et al (2008) ¹³ Lowering resting blood Lee et al (2008) ²² Reducing of blood pressure Reducing of blood pressure and ink factors Lee et al (2008) ²² Reducing of blood pressure Reducing of blood pressure Reducing of blood pressure Lee et al (2008) ²⁴ Osteoprosis Mayne et al (2008) ²⁵ Bone-mineral density	6	Variable	No	There is limited evidence	7	+1	Netherlands
Hall <i>et al</i> (2009) ¹¹ Musculoskeletal pain Lee <i>et al</i> (2007) ¹³ Rheumatoid arthritis Han <i>et al</i> (2004) ¹⁴ Osteoarthritis Rheumatoid arthritis Rheumatoid arthritis Han <i>et al</i> (2003) ¹⁵ Multiple sclerosis Sinns and Taylor (2008) ¹⁵ Multiple sclerosis Dio <i>et al</i> (2009) ¹⁷ Capacity Lee <i>et al</i> (2009) ¹⁹ Improvement of aerobic Cardiovascular disease and risk factors Lewering resting blood risk factors Lee <i>et al</i> (2008) ²² Reducing of blood pressure ee <i>et al</i> (2008) ²² Reducing of blood pressure Lee <i>et al</i> (2008) ²² Reducing of blood pressure Lee <i>et al</i> (2008) ²³ Reducing of blood pressure	с	Poor	No	The evidence is insufficient	5	+1	UK
ee et al (2008) ¹² Osteoarthritis i= ee et al (2007) ¹³ Rheumatoid arthritis han et al (2004) ¹⁴ Rheumatoid arthritis binns and Taylor (2008) ¹⁵ Multiple sclerosis binns and Taylor (2008) ¹⁵ Multiple sclerosis binns and Taylor (2008) ¹⁶ Muscle strength and choi et al (2009) ¹⁷ Eapacity cee et al (2009) ¹⁹ Improving aerobic capacity fiel et al (2009) ¹⁹ Cardiovascular disease and cee et al (2007) ²⁰ Cardiovascular disease and cee et al (2008) ¹⁸ Lowering resting blood ee et al (2008) ²² Reducing of blood pressure ee et al (2008) ²² Reducing of blood pressure feh et al (2008) ²³ Reducing of blood pressure Anyne et al (2008) ²⁴ Osteoprosis	7	Variable	Pain reduction: WMD, 10.12 (13.92, 0.63)	T'ai chi has a small positive effect	7	+	Australia
ee et al (2007) ¹³ Rheumatoid arthritis lan et al (2004) ¹⁴ Rheumatoid arthritis sinns and Taylor (2008) ¹⁵ Multiple sclerosis choi et al (2005) ¹⁶ Muscle strength and flexibility cee et al (2009) ¹⁷ Capacity iaylor-Piliae (2008) ¹⁸ Improvement of aerobic capacity che et al (2009) ¹⁹ Cardiovascular disease and risk factors cee et al (2007) ²⁰ Cardiovascular disease and risk factors ee et al (2007) ²⁰ Lowering resting blood pressure ee et al (2008) ²² Reducing of blood pressure and risk factors ee et al (2008) ²³ Reducing blood pressure and risk factors ee et al (2008) ²⁴ Reducing of blood pressure and risk factors ee et al (2008) ²³ Reducing of blood pressure and risk factors ee et al (2008) ²⁴ Reducing lood pressure and risk factors ee et al (2008) ²⁴ Bone-mineral density	5	Good	No	there is some encouraging evidence	5	+	UK
lan et al (2004) ¹⁴ Rheumatoid arthritis lan et al (2005) ¹⁶ Multiple sclerosis Choi et al (2005) ¹⁶ Muscle strength and flexibility Lee et al (2009) ¹⁷ Capacity aylor-Piliae (2008) ¹⁸ Improvement of aerobic capacity Taylor-Piliae (2008) ¹⁹ Improving aerobic capacity ceh et al (2009) ¹⁹ Cardiovascular disease and risk factors cee et al (2007) ²⁰ Cardiovascular disease and risk factors cee et al (2009) ²¹ Lowering resting blood pressure ee et al (2008) ²² Reducing of blood pressure ee et al (2008) ²³ Reducing blood pressure and improving cardiopulmonary function cee et al (2008) ²⁴ Steoporosis	2	Poor	No	evidence is not convincing	7	I	UK
Sinns and Taylor (2008) ¹⁵ Muttiple sclerosis Choi et al (2005) ¹⁶ Muscle strength and flexibility .ee et al (2009) ¹⁷ Improvement of aerobic capacity Taylor-Piliae (2008) ¹⁸ Improving aerobic capacity (eh et al (2009) ¹⁹ Cardiovascular disease and risk factors .ee et al (2007) ²⁰ Cardiovascular disease and risk factors .ee et al (2007) ²⁰ Cardiovascular disease and risk factors .ee et al (2008) ²¹ Lowering resting blood pressure .ee et al (2008) ²² Reducing of blood pressure and risk factors .ee et al (2008) ²³ Reducing blood pressure and risk factors .ee et al (2008) ²⁴ Reducing of blood pressure and risk factors .ee et al (2008) ²⁴ Reducing of blood pressure and improving cardiopulmonary function .ee et al (2008) ²⁴ Osteoporosis	e	Poor	Yes (meta-analysis with CCTs—not meaningful)	T'ai chi does not exacerbate	7	I	Canada
Choi et al (2005) ¹⁶ Muscle strength and flexibility .ee et al (2009) ¹⁷ Improvement of aerobic capacity aylor-Piliae (2008) ¹⁸ Improving aerobic capacity feh et al (2009) ¹⁹ Cardiovascular disease and risk factors .ee et al (2007) ²⁰ Cardiovascular disease and risk factors .ee et al (2007) ²⁰ Cardiovascular disease and risk factors .ee et al (2003) ²¹ Lowering resting blood pressure .ee et al (2008) ²² Reducing of blood pressure and improving cardiopulmonary function .ee et al (2008) ²³ Reducing blood pressure and improving cardiopulmonary function	0	Poor	No	Key findings include improve in	1	+	New Zealand
.ce et al (2009) ¹⁷ Improvement of aerobic capacity Taylor-Piliae (2008) ¹⁸ Improving aerobic capacity (eh et al (2009) ¹⁹ Cardiovascular disease and risk factors .ee et al (2007) ²⁰ Cardiovascular disease and risk factors .ee et al (2010) ²¹ Lowering resting blood risk factors .ee et al (2008) ²² Reducing of blood pressure and risk factors .ee et al (2008) ²² Reducing blood pressure and pressure and improving cardiopulmonary function .ee et al (2008) ²³ Reducing blood pressure and improving cardiopulmonary function	ę	Poor	No	75% of papers were significantly improvement in	-	+	Korea
[aylor-piljae (2008) ¹⁸ Improving aerobic capacity (eh et al (2009) ¹⁹ Cardiovascular disease and .ee et al (2007) ²⁰ Cardiovascular disease and .ee et al (2007) ²⁰ Cardiovascular disease and .ee et al (2008) ¹⁸ Lowering resting blood .ee et al (2008) ²² Reducing of blood pressure .ee et al (2008) ²² Reducing blood pressure and .ee et al (2005) ²³ Reducing blood pressure and .ee et al (2008) ²⁴ Osteoporosis	5	Good	WMD, 0.50 (1.1, 2.15)	the existing evidence does not suggest	7	I	Korea
(eh et al (2009) ¹⁹ Cardiovascular disease and risk factors .ee et al (2007) ²⁰ Cardiovascular disease and risk factors .ee et al (2010) ²¹ Lowering resting blood pressure in older people .eh et al (2008) ²² Reducing of blood pressure and improving cardiopulmonary function .ee et al (2008) ²³ Reducing blood pressure and improving cardiopulmonary function .ee et al (2008) ²⁴ Osteoporosis	4	Good	ES=0.38 (0.10, 0.85)	T'ai chi is effective in	3	+	USA
.ee et al (2007) ²⁰ Cardiovascular disease and risk factors .ee et al (2010) ²¹ Lowering resting blood pressure in older people (eh et al (2008) ²² Reducing of blood pressure and improving cardiopulmonary function .ee et al (2008) ²³ Reducing blood pressure and improving cardiopulmonary function .ee et al (2008) ²⁴ Osteoprosis	6	Variable	No	. T'ai chi exercise may be a beneficial adjunctive therapy	4	+	NSA
.ee et al (2010) ²¹ Lowering resting blood (eh et al (2008) ²² Reducing of blood pressure cun et al (2005) ²³ Reducing blood pressure cun et al (2008) ²⁴ Reducing blood pressure cun et al (2008) ²⁴ Osteoporosis Mayne et al (2007) ²⁵ Bone-mineral density	6	Variable	SBP: WMD, 21.5 (25.8, 17.1) DBP: WMD, 12.1 (15.3, 8.8)	T'ai chi for CV and its risk factors is scarce	ى	I	N
 (eh et al (2008)²² Reducing of blood pressure cun et al (2005)²³ Reducing blood pressure and improving cardiopulmonary function ee et al (2008)²⁴ Osteoporosis Mayne et al (2007)²⁵ Bone-mineral density 	4	Variable	SBP: WMD, 2.5 (5.90, 0.90) DBP: WMD 1.49 (3.50, 0.52)	The evidence is limited	7	+1	Korea
cun <i>et al</i> (2005) ²³ Reducing blood pressure and improving cardiopulmonary function ee <i>et al</i> (2008) ²⁴ Osteoporosis Nayne <i>et al</i> (2007) ²⁵ Bone-mineral density	6	Variable	No	T'ai chi exercise may reduce BP	4	+	USA
.ee <i>et al</i> (2008) ²⁴ Osteoporosis Nayne <i>et al</i> (2007) ²⁵ Bone-mineral density	7	Good	No	T'ai chi exercise over 16 weeks improves	2	+	Korea
Vayne <i>et al</i> (2007) ²⁵ Bone-mineral density	ъ	Variable	Bone mineral density: WMD 0.02 (0.02, 0.06)	The evidence is not convincing	7	I	UK
	2	Variable	No	limited evidence	4	+1	NSA
ee et al (2008) ²⁰ lype 2 diabetes	2	Good	No	evidence is scarce and not convincing	4	I	UK
Vang <i>et al</i> (2010) ²⁷ Psychological well-being 1	1	Variable	Stress reduction: ES 0.66 (0.23, 1.09) anxiety: ES 0.66 (0.29, 1.03) depression: ES 0.56 (0.31, 0.80) mood: ES	T'ai chi appears to be associated with improvements in	۵	+	USA

Continued

Table 1 Continued								
		No of randomised	Quality of randomised			Quality of svstematic		
Author (year)(reference)	Condition/population	controlled trials	controlled trials	Meta-analysis†	Conclusion (quote)	réview 00A0*	Result	Country
Berghmans <i>et al</i> (2009) ²⁸	Improving mental and physical health	47	Variable	No	Our study has demonstrated a real potential exists	1	+	France
Wang <i>et al</i> (2009) ²⁹	Improving psychological well-being	15	Variable	No	It is still premature to make any conclusive remarks	2	+1	Australia
Dechamps <i>et al</i> (2007) ³⁰	Self-efficacy and psychological health	8	Variable	No	T'ai chi benefits appeared to be more tangible	4	+	France
Sandlund and Norlander (2000) ³¹	Stress response and well- being	m	Variable	No	T'ai chi exercise may lead to improvement in mood	-	+	Sweden
Logghe <i>et al</i> (2010) ³²	Fall prevention, fear of falling and balance	σ	Variable	Compared with exercise - fall rates: RR 0.51(0.38, 0.68) Compared with non-exercise - fall rates: RR 0.79 (0.60, 1.03);	Currently there is insufficient evidence	2	+1	Netherland
Low <i>et a</i> /(2009) ³³	Fall reduction	7	Variable	No	T'ai chi has the potential	4	+	Singapore
Gregory and Watson (2009) ³⁴	Fall prevention	9	Variable	No	T'ai chi may be beneficial	5	+	UK
Harling and Simpson (2008) ³⁵	Reducing falls and fear of falling	7	Variable	No	There is strong	9	+	UK
Komagata and Newton (2003) ³⁶	Improving balance	11	Variable	No	T'ai chi is effective	5	+	NSA
Wu (2002) ³⁷	Improving balance and pre- venting fall	9	Poor	No	only scattered evidence	-	+1	NSA
Wang <i>et al</i> (2004) ³⁸	Any chronic condition	6	Mostly poor	No	T'ai chi appears to be effective	2	+	NSA
Klein and Adams (2004) ³⁹	Any	12	Good	No	Controlled research evidence was found to confirm therapeutic benefits	4	+	NSA
*00A0, Overview Quality A DBP, diastolic blood pressur †, the values are expressed i	ssessment Questionnaire. The over e; ES, effect size; RR, relative risk; S as SMD, WMD , or RR and (95% con	all score ranges from 1 SBP, systolic blood pres nfidence intervals).	to 7. 00A0 ≤ 3, exte sure; SMD, standard	nsive or major flaws; $OQAQ \leq 5$, mean difference; WMD, weight	minor or minimal flaws; +, overall positive; -, fa mean difference.	il to show effectiver	ıess; ±, unc	ear.

Table 2	Indications	evaluated	by	multiple	system	natic	reviews	(SRs)
---------	-------------	-----------	----	----------	--------	-------	---------	-------

		Direc	tion of re	sults				
Condition	No of SRs	+	±	-	Overall effects	Comments		
Breast cancer	2	0	0	2	_	Both SRs are of high quality		
Old age	3	2	1	0	+	Positive SR is of poor quality		
Rheumatoid arthritis	2	0	0	2	-	Cochrane review is negative		
Improving aerobic capacity	2	1	0	1	±	Positive SR is of poor quality		
Cardiovascular disease and risk factors	2	1	0	1	±	Contradiction exists in interpretation		
Lowering blood pressure	3	2	1	0	±	Positive SRs are of poor quality		
Osteoporosis or bone mineral density	2	0	1	1	±	Positive SR included more trials that originate from China		
Psychological health	5	5	1	0	+	Methodological quality is variable		
Fall prevention	4	3	1	0	+	All of the included SRs are of high quality		
Improving balance	2	1	1	0	+	Newer SR is more positive		

+, positive conclusion; ±, conclusion neither positive nor negative; -, negative conclusion.



Figure 1 Flow chart of the publication-selection process. SR, systematic review.

The SRs covered a wide range of conditions and situations, including the following: cancer, general healthcare in older people, Parkinson's disease, musculoskeletal pain, osteoar-thritis, rheumatoid arthritis (RA), muscle strength and flex-ibility, improving aerobic capacity, cardiovascular disease and risk factors, lowering resting blood pressure, osteoporosis or bone mineral density, type 2 diabetes, psychological health, fall prevention and improving balance, as well as any chronic conditions. Based on the OQAQ scores, the quality of the SRs varied; 17 SRs had minimal bias, ^{5 6 9-14 17 20 21 24 27 32 34-36} 11 had major flaws, ^{7 8 15 16 18 23 28 29 31 37 38} and the remaining seven SRs had moderate flaws.^{19 22 25 26 30 33 39}

Seven SRs concluded that the current data were insufficient to draw firm conclusions,⁸ ¹⁰ ²¹ ²⁵ ²⁹ ³² ³⁷ eight SRs concluded that t'ai chi did not have a beneficial effect, ⁵ ⁶ ¹³ ¹⁴ ¹⁷ ²⁰ ²⁴ ²⁶ and 20 SRs concluded that t'ai chi might be effective.⁷ ⁸ ¹¹ ¹² ¹⁵ ¹⁶ ¹⁸ ¹⁹ ²² ²³ ²⁷ ²⁸ ³⁰ ³¹ ³³ ⁻³⁶ ³⁸ ³⁹ Of the nine high-quality SRs, ⁵ ⁹ ¹¹ ¹³ ¹⁴ ¹⁷ ²¹ ²⁴ ³² one arrived at a positive conclusion, ¹¹ five arrived at a negative conclusion, ⁵ ¹³ ¹⁴ ¹⁷ ²⁴ and in three SRs, ⁹ ²¹ ³² no clear conclusions were drawn.

A relatively clear consensus existed that t'ai chi was effective for improving the general health of older people, improving psychological health, and for preventing falls (table 2). Of the four

SRs that evaluated fall prevention,³²⁻³⁵ three showed clearly positive effects of t'ai chi,³³⁻³⁵ whereas one cast doubt on the effectiveness of t'ai chi.³² In terms of improving psychological health, four SRs drew positive conclusions,²⁷ ²⁸ ³⁰ ³¹ whereas one was inconclusive.²⁹ All three SRs that evaluated healthcare in older people drew equivocal positive conclusions.⁷⁻⁹ For the symptomatic treatment of RA¹³ ¹⁴ and cancer,⁵ ⁶ the evidence appeared to be clearly negative based on the two SRs that drew negative conclusions, respectively. Clear contradictions emerged in terms of improving aerobic capacity,^{17 18} improving cardiovascular disease and its risk factors,^{19 20} and improving balance;^{36 37} one positive SR and one negative SR were found for each of those indications. However, positive SRs were of poor quality and included flaws for several indications including general healthcare of older people, improving aerobic capacity and lowering blood pressure. Furthermore, positive SRs included more trials from China or no randomised controlled trials (RCTs). Hence, caution should be exercised in interpreting the evidence for these conditions.

DISCUSSION

Our analysis showed that 35 SRs of t'ai chi used in the treatment of various health conditions have been recently published, which indicates that the interest in this subject has grown considerably; however, the conclusions of the SRs are not consistent. The evidence for fall prevention, healthcare for older people, improving psychological health, cancer and RA is relatively clear (table 2). However, contradictions emerge when examining the effects on improving aerobic capacity and improving cardiovascular disease and its risk factors. In terms of improving aerobic capacity, these contradictions can be explained by the time difference between the two SRs.¹⁷¹⁸ The more recent SR included a more rigorous study with negative results that had been conducted since the publication of the earlier SR.¹⁷ Thus, overall, the current best evidence seems to suggest that t'ai chi is not effective for this indication. In terms of cardiovascular disease and risk factors, the results might be more complex.^{19 20} The two SRs included the same RCTs, but the conclusions were different. One of the SRs drew an equivocal conclusion,²⁰ whereas the other drew a positive conclusion.¹⁹ Thus, the current best evidence is not clearly positive.

The SRs related to Parkinson's disease¹⁰ and type 2 diabetes²⁶ were based on relatively small numbers of primary studies. Thus, their conclusions may be less reliable. This indicates that more high-quality studies are required for the evaluation of these indications.

What is already known on this topic

T'ai chi, is a form of complementary therapy, and has been used in the treatment of various conditions and has been reported as beneficial for reducing blood pressure and knee pain, improving balance and muscle strength, and improving fall prevention.

What this study adds

Numerous systematic reviews, often with contradictory conclusions, exist but only for two conditions (fall prevention and psychological health improvement) is the evidence convincingly positive.

Our overview showed that t'ai chi, which combines deep breathing and relaxation with slow and gentle movements, may exert exercise-based general benefits for fall prevention and improvement of balance in older people as well as some meditative effects for improving psychological health. We recommend t'ai chi for older people for its various physical and psychological benefits. However, t'ai chi may not effectively treat inflammatory diseases and cardiorespiratory disorders.

Most of the SRs were of high quality, but many primary studies evaluated in these SRs were associated with a high risk of bias. Common study weaknesses included small sample sizes and lack of an adequate control group. This means that the SRs draw conclusions that are often not definite or final.

Our overview has several limitations. Our literature searches of the English, Chinese and Korean databases were extensive, but we cannot be absolutely sure that all relevant articles were located. Our overview was aimed at evaluating the SRs rather than the individual primary studies, which means there is a risk of diluting the results of high-quality studies by including low-quality data.

Future research on t'ai chi should be conducted more rigorously. We recommend that researchers follow the CONSORT guidelines when designing and reporting clinical trials.⁴⁰ Our overview of SRs complied with the PRISMA guidelines, and we recommend that future SRs do so as well to produce highquality systemic reviews.⁴¹

In conclusion, several SRs of t'ai chi used in the treatment of a wide range of conditions have recently been published. They suggest that the evidence is conclusively or tentatively positive for fall prevention, general healthcare in older people, improving balance and enhancing psychological health. For cancer, aerobic capacity and RA, the evidence from SRs was not conclusively positive.

Funding MSL was supported by KIOM (K10251).

Competing interests None.

Provenance and peer review Not commissioned; externally peer reviewed.

REFERENCES

- Ernst E, Pittler MH, Wider B, et al. Oxford Handbook of Complementary Medicine. Oxford: Oxford University Press 2008.
- Jahnke R, Larkey L, Rogers C, et al. A comprehensive review of health benefits of gigong and tai chi. Am J Health Promot 2010;24:e1–e25.

- Birdee GS, Wayne PM, Davis RB, et al. T'ai chi and qigong for health: patterns of use in the United States. J Altern Complement Med 2009;15:969–73.
- Oxman AD, Guyatt GH. Validation of an index of the quality of review articles. J Clin Epidemiol 1991;44:1271–8.
- Lee MS, Choi TY, Ernst E. Tai chi for breast cancer patients: a systematic review. Breast Cancer Res Treat 2010;120:309–16.
- Lee MS, Pittler MH, Ernst E. Is Tai Chi an effective adjunct in cancer care? A systematic review of controlled clinical trials. *Support Care Cancer* 2007;15:597–601.
- Rogers CE, Larkey LK, Keller C. A review of clinical trials of tai chi and qigong in older adults. West J Nurs Res 2009;31:245–79.
- Lee HY, Kim KJ. Analysis of the effectiveness of tai chi exercise in elderly. *J Muscle Joint Health* 2009:615:3423.2012;46:708–713. doi:10.1136/bjsm.2010.080622
- Verhagen AP, Immink M, van der Meulen A, et al. The efficacy of Tai Chi Chuan in older adults: a systematic review. Fam Pract 2004;21:107–13.
- 10. Lee MS, Lam P, Ernst E. Effectiveness of tai chi for Parkinson's disease: a critical review. *Parkinsonism Relat Disord* 2008;**14**:589–94.
- Hall A, Maher C, Latimer J, et al. The effectiveness of Tai Chi for chronic musculoskeletal pain conditions: a systematic review and meta-analysis. Arthritis Rheum 2009;61:717–24.
- Lee MS, Pittler MH, Ernst E. Tai chi for osteoarthritis: a systematic review. *Clin Rheumatol* 2008;27:211–18.
- Lee MS, Pittler MH, Ernst E. Tai chi for rheumatoid arthritis: systematic review. *Rheumatology (Oxford)* 2007;46:1648–51.
- 14. Han A, Judd M, Welch V, et al. Tai chi for treating rheumatoid arthritis. Cochrane Database Syst Rev 2004:3:CD004849.
- Binns EE, Taylor D. Does tai chi improve strength and balance in people with multiple sclerosis—the current literature. Nz J Physiother 2008;36:83.
- Choi JH, Lee EO, Lee HY, et al. Analysis of the effect of tai chi on muscle strength and flexibility. J Rheumatol Health 2005;12:69–80.
- 17. **Lee MS**, Lee EN, Ernst E. Is tai chi beneficial for improving aerobic capacity? A systematic review. *Br J Sports Med* 2009;**43**:569–73.
- Taylor-Piliae RE. The effectiveness of Tai Chi exercise in improving aerobic capacity: an updated meta-analysis. *Med Sport Sci* 2008;52:40–53.
- Yeh GY, Wang C, Wayne PM, et al. Tai chi exercise for patients with cardiovascular conditions and risk factors: a systematic review. J Cardiopulm Rehabil Prev 2009;29:152–60.
- Lee MS, Pittler MH, Taylor-Piliae RE, et al. Tai chi for cardiovascular disease and its risk factors: a systematic review. J Hypertens 2007;25:1974–5.
- 21. Lee MS, Lee EN, Kim JI, *et al.* Tai chi for lowering resting blood pressure in the elderly: a systematic review. *J Eval Clin Pract* 2010;**16**:818–24.
- Yeh GY, Wang C, Wayne PM, et al. The effect of tai chi exercise on blood pressure: a systematic review. Prev Cardiol 2008;11:82–9.
- Eun Y, Lee HY, Choi JH, et al. Review of analysis of the effect of tai chi exercise on blood pressure and cardiopulmonary function. J Rheumatol Health 2005;12:132–42.
- 24. Lee MS, Pittler MH, Shin BC, et al. Tai chi for osteoporosis: a systematic review. Osteoporos Int 2008;19:139–46.
- Wayne PM, Kiel DP, Krebs DE, *et al.* The effects of Tai Chi on bone mineral density in postmenopausal women: a systematic review. *Arch Phys Med Rehabil* 2007;88:673–80.
- Lee MS, Pittler MH, Kim MS, et al. Tai chi for Type 2 diabetes: a systematic review. Diabet Med 2008;25:240–1.
- Wang C, Bannuru R, Ramel J, et al. Tai Chi on psychological well-being: systematic review and meta-analysis. BMC Complement Altern Med 2010;10:23.
- Berghmans C, Kretsch M, Branchi S, *et al.* Effets du taï-chi-chuan sur la santé psychique et physique: une revue systématique de question. *Journal de Thérapie Comportementale et Cognitive* 2009;**19**:4–29.
- Wang WC, Zhang AL, Rasmussen B, et al. The effect of Tai Chi on psychosocial well-being: a systematic review of randomized controlled trials. J Acupunct Meridian Stud 2009;2:171–81.
- Dechamps A, Lafont L, Bourdel-Marchasson I. Effects of Tai Chi exercises on self-efficacy and psychological health. *Eur Rev Aging Phys Act* 2007;4:25–32.
- Sandlund ES, Norlander T. The effects of tai chi chuan relaxation and exercise on stress responses and well-being: an overview of research. Int J Stress Manage 2000;7:139–49.
- Logghe IH, Verhagen AP, Rademaker AC, *et al*. The effects of Tai Chi on fall prevention, fear of falling and balance in older people: A meta-analysis. *Prev Med* 2010;51:222–7.
- Low S, Ang LW, Goh KS, et al. A systematic review of the effectiveness of Tai Chi on fall reduction among the elderly. Arch Gerontol Geriatr 2009;48:325–31.
- Gregory H, Watson MC. The effectiveness of Tai Chi as a fall prevention intervention for older adults: A systematic review. Int J Health Promot Educ 2009;47:94–100.
- Harling A, Simpson JP. A systematic review to determine the effectiveness of Tai Chi in reducing falls and fear of falling in older adults. *Physical Therapy Reviews* 2008;13:237–48.

Review

- Komagata S, Newton R. The effectiveness of Tai Chi on improving balance in older adults: an evidence-based review. *J Geriatr Phys Ther* 2003;26:9–16.
- Wu G. Evaluation of the effectiveness of Tai Chi for improving balance and preventing falls in the older population–a review. J Am Geriatr Soc 2002;50:746–54.
- Wang C, Collet JP, Lau J. The effect of Tai Chi on health outcomes in patients with chronic conditions: a systematic review. *Arch Intern Med* 2004;164:493–501.
- Klein PJ, Adams WD. Comprehensive therapeutic benefits of Taiji: a critical review. Am J Phys Med Rehabil 2004;83:735–45.
- 40. Schulz KF, Altman DG, Moher D. CONSORT 2010 statement: updated guidelines for reporting parallel group randomised trials. *BMJ* 2010;340:c332.
- PRISMA. Preferred Reporting Items of Systematic reviews and Meta-Analyses (PRISMA) Statement. http://www.prisma-statement.org/index.htm. Updated in 2009. (Accessed 9 Apr 2011).



Systematic reviews of t'ai chi: an overview

Myeong Soo Lee and Edzard Ernst

Br J Sports Med 2012 46: 713-718 originally published online May 16, 2011 doi: 10.1136/bjsm.2010.080622

Updated information and services can be found at: http://bjsm.bmj.com/content/46/10/713

	These include:
References	This article cites 39 articles, 5 of which you can access for free at: http://bjsm.bmj.com/content/46/10/713#BIBL
Email alerting service	Receive free email alerts when new articles cite this article. Sign up in the box at the top right corner of the online article.
Topic Collections	Articles on similar topics can be found in the following collections Press releases (26) Degenerative joint disease (206) Musculoskeletal syndromes (383) Osteoarthritis (94)

Notes

To request permissions go to: http://group.bmj.com/group/rights-licensing/permissions

To order reprints go to: http://journals.bmj.com/cgi/reprintform

To subscribe to BMJ go to: http://group.bmj.com/subscribe/